

UNIVERSALISM

By D. M. PANTON.

SEVENTH THOUSAND.

London :

CHAS. J. THYNNE, 28 Whitefriars' St., E.C. 4.

Price 1½d. each, post free, 2d. 100 copies, post free, 11/-

50 copies, post free, 6/- 100 copies, post free, 11/-

500 copies, post free, 52/6

1892.

PERILS OF THE AGE.—12.

PERILS OF THE AGE.—2.

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE.

SEVENTEENTH THOUSAND.

By D. M. PANTON.

London :

CHAS. J. THYNNE & JARVIS, Ltd.,
28, Whitefriars' Street, E.C. 4.

Price 1½d. each, post free, 2d. 12 copies, post free, 1/9
50 copies, post free, 6/- 100 copies, post free, 11/-
500 copies, post free, 52/6.

Nov. 1926.

UNIVERSALISM, or the ultimate salvation of all men after a more or less prolonged sojourn in hell, or with no hell at all, is a theory that was originated in the third century by Origen; of whom the ecclesiastical historian Moshelm says that "the divine simplicity of the Truth is scarcely discernible through the cobweb veil of his allegories." Since one passage, and perhaps one alone in the Bible, looks in the direction of Universalism, it is obvious that if that link snaps, the whole chain drops, so far as the system is supposed to be based on the Holy Scriptures. Now it is certain that this Scripture states that all creation, all persons whatsoever in the illustrious universe, will one day, personally and openly, confess Christ. "God highly exalted Him, and gave unto Him the name which is above every name; that"—in order that, as the purpose and result of the exaltation—"in the name of Jesus

129 HIGH STREET,
LONDON BRIDGE FREE PRESS LTD.

UNIVERSALISM

BY THE SAME AUTHOR.

PRESENT-DAY PAPERS.

God's Oil and Our Vessels (2d.)	Marriage and the Woman Movement (2d.)
Bread for God's People (2d.)	Sin after Conversion (1d.)
The Prayer Battle (2d.)	Our Seat of Authority (1d.)
Verbal Inspiration (2d.)	A Federated Church (2d.)
Watchman, What of the Night? (2d.)	The First Resurrection (2d.)
Outline of the Apocalypse (1d.)	Earth's Last Pentecost (2d.)
The Last Hour of Foreign Missions (1d.)	Evolution and the Fall (2d.)
The Letters to the Seven Churches (2d.)	The Disciple and the State (2d.)
	Maranatha (Poems) (2d.)

PERILS OF THE AGE, FIRST SERIES.

The set bound in paper boards, 2/- net.

Millennial Dawnism (1d.)	Spiritualism (1½d.)
Christian Science (1½d.)	The Order of the Star in the East (1½d.)
Church Amusements (1½d.)	God's Term of Communion (1½d.)
The Growth of Rome (1½d.)	Secret of the Great War (1½d.)
Modernism (1½d.)	Universalism (1½d.)
Tests for the Supernatural (1½d.)	Spiritualism Inside the Churches (1½d.)
The Seed, The Ox, and The Garment (1½d.)	Earthquakes (2d.)
Prayer for the Lord's Return (1½d.)	The Cry of the Children (1½d.)
1½d. Pamphlets—single copy, post free, 2½d.; 12, 1/9; 50, 6/-; 100, 11/-	3d.; 12, 2/4; 50, 8/-; 100, 15/-

All Post or Carriage Free and may be assorted.

CHAS. J. THYNNE & JARVIS, Ltd.,

28-30, Whitefriars' Street, Fleet Street, London, E.C.4.

Christian Science

THE denials which Christian Science offers to all the vitals of the Christian Faith is a denial frank and unashamed. *Christian Science denies that man is fallen¹: it denies that any judgment awaits mankind²: it denies any power or advantage in prayer³: it denies the existence of the Holy Spirit⁴: it denies any efficacy in the atonement of Christ⁵: it denies that Jesus was the Christ⁶: it denies that our Lord was in any sense the Son of God in which another man is not⁷: it denies that our Lord either died or rose again⁸: and it denies that God is a personal Being at all⁹.* The soul that sincerely confounds such a system

1. "Man is unfallen": "The great truth that man was, is, and shall be perfect is incontrovertible" (*Science and Health*, pp. 472, 96).
2. "No final judgment awaits mortals" (p. 187).
3. "Prayer to a personal God is a hindrance" (p. 7).
4. "The Holy Ghost is divine science" (p. 579).
5. "One sacrifice, however great, is insufficient to pay the debt of sin" (p. 328).
6. "The invisible Christ was incorporeal, whereas Jesus was a corporeal or bodily existence" (p. 229).
7. "Jesus was not God's Son in any other sense than every man is God's son" (p. 229).
8. "His disciples believed Jesus dead while he was hidden in the sepulchre; whereas He was alive" (p. 317).
9. "God is mind. He is divine principal, not person" (p. 317).

1 When our LORD speaks of soul and body being plunged in Gehenna (Matt. x. 28), if the soul ceases, or if the fire ceases, and our Lord did not say so though He knew it, is it possible or credible that He should have shrouded so stupendous a fact in silence, or have left us such a misleading half-truth alone? Nothing but the fact can ever justify the statement of an eternal hell. Again, if a soul is in

legion of demons besought Him to suffer them "to enter into the swine," a prayer of absolute submission to His authority, a knee uttered bent; and such was their acknowledgment of the Lordship of Christ that they said,—"Art Thou come to torment us before the time?" for not only did they see no salvation for themselves in the future, but they acclaimed Christ as their final and supreme Judge, without a moment's hesitation or doubt. If this happened when Jesus was about to perish on the Cross, will it not happen when He is Lord upon the Throne? The fallen and malignant beings hated Christ, yet knew, and had to confess, Who He was and what He was: it was a homage exacted by iron fact, not the regenerate worship of a loving heart. Now, since this subjection of hell to our Lord when on earth was one of His most extraordinary glories, so will it be again, and so also will it be to the glory of God the Father. The confession has already been offered by evil beings who were never saved.

Who Thou art, the HOLY ONE OF GOD"; a whole again cried in open confession,—"I know Thee spirits, when confronted by our LORD, again and to Christ by unredeemed creatures. The unclear This homage is exactly what has already been offered saved. But an awkward fact at once confronts us of redeemed creatures; that is, of a universe entirely Father," therefore it must be the unforced worship this worship is said to be "to the glory of God the worship would not be to the glory of God, and as Now the Universalist says that, since a forced

universality could be more complete. not one knee unbent; not one tongue silent: no name, every knee bowed, every tongue confessing; the Father;" (Phil. ii. 11.) A name above every tongue confessing that before which the knee bows as the Greek word means, openly and plainly; the and that HEAVY TONGUE"—therefore every person- the dead (Rom. x. 7) and demons (Luke viii. 31); under the earth"—the abyss, the home of both earth"—the totality of mankind—"and things whatsoever, fallen and unfallen—"and things on acknowledgment of a worshipping will; "of things in heaven"—all unseen principles and powers the bent knee, in dumb

with the Christian Faith is dwelling, alas, in an ignorance well-nigh desperate and irreclaimable.

But this tract is not concerned to disprove Christian Science, or to expose it as an error peculiarly daring and deadly; but rather to unmask it for what it actually is—a recrudescence of Gnosticism. For, in the words of Dr. Gray, "it is not a new religion, but an old one; as old, at least, as the apostolic era, where it raised its head as one of the phases of Gnosticism." "Christian Science," as Mr. J. H. Wiggin, one of the original editors of *Science and Health*, acknowledges, "on its theological side, is an ignorant revival of one form of ancient Gnosticism;" and its birthplace is under the shadow of Emerson, "whose subtle affinity with the old Gnosticism," says Mr. W. Hague, "is clearly apparent, and whose completed work presents him to the world as the first American writer whose speculative trend looks sympathetically to the Gnostic ideas." Amid much that is chaotic and unintelligible, three fundamentals, confessed as such by all Christian Scientists, reveal its deep blood-relationship with Gnostic inspiration;—the unreality of matter, the unreality of sin, and the unreality of our Lord's Person. It is a disintegration of Christian truth by the demonic philosophies of the hoary East: it is a recrudescence of the most dreaded foe of the Christian Faith, Gnosticism.

1. Christian Science denies the reality of matter, and thus reduces the world to an illusion. "Nothing we can say or believe regarding matter is true, except

that matter is unreal¹. . . Knowledge gained from matter, and through material senses, is only an illusion². . . Nothing is matter.³" This is one of the oldest of Gnostic deceptions. It is at once overthrown by the Scriptures. Matter is no illusion, no mirage created by the senses; for God made the world before He made the senses which perceive it. Man appeared only after the world had been made, and been seen, by God as a concrete reality: "and God saw that it was good. And God said, let us make man" (Gen. i. 25). Moreover, matter will, one day, become as imperishable as our senses that perceive it. "And he that sitteth on the throne said, Behold, I make all things new. . . . And I saw a new heaven and a new earth" (Rev. xxi. 5, 1): an earth as everlasting as redeemed sight and touch. "The creation itself also shall be delivered from the bondage of corruption into the liberty of the glory of the children of God" (Rom. viii. 21). Christ never died for an illusory world.

2. Christian Science denies the reality of sin. "There is no sin. To put down the claim of sin you must . . . point out its illusion, and prove its unreality⁴. . . Sin exists only so long as the material illusion remains. It is the sense of sin, and not the sinful soul, which must be lost.⁵. . . All is

1 *Science and Health*, p. 173, 110 ed.
 2 *Ibid.*, p. 170. 3 *Ibid.*, p. 7.
 4 *Science and Health*, p. 444.
 5 *Ibid.*, p. 207.

if so, then there are no lost that appear before that Throne; but what do we read? "They were judged every man according to their works; and if any was not found written in the book of life, he was cast into the lake of fire" (Rev. xx. 15). A system which can overthrow the final judgment needs no continuation: it is loaded to the water's brim with the dynamite of its own explosion. For it is clear that this universal homage is offered at the Second Advent: "when He again bringeth in the First-born into the world He saith, And let all the angels of God worship Him" (Heb. i. 6): so at the moment our Lord is on the threshold of His Return, we read,—"And every creature which is in the heaven, and on the earth, and under the earth, heard I saying, Unto Him that sitteth on the throne, and unto the Lamb, be the blessing, and the honour, and the glory, and the dominion for ever and ever." (Rev. v. 18.)

For an extraordinary finality is stamped upon the last judgment scene. "And books were opened; and the dead were judged out of the things which were written in the books, according to their works." (Rev. xx. 12). That is, the life-work of each is perfectly finished; it cannot be added to, or taken from, or altered—it can only be judged; after this, no works are recorded, only sufferings. All other

The second fact about this passage—the date of its fulfilment—is final against the Universalist. For the Restorationist says that hell is real, and may last millions of years, but that this passage reveals every soul delivered at length from hell. The answer is simple. *This passage deals with an event before the wicked are cast into hell at all.* "Things in heaven, and things on earth, and things under the earth"—that is, in the deep underworld, Hades: this is a description of the earth as it is. Now Hades will be cast into the Lake of Fire, and indeed the whole earth itself is burnt up and vanishes utterly from before the Great White Throne, therefore this universal homage takes place before hell has begun at all: therefore, if the Universalist's view of it were correct, all men must be saved before the wicked are cast into hell (Rev. xx. 13): therefore the wretched are cast into hell at all. The fury of God's wrath unnumbered (Rev. xv. 10)—"unguendable" (Mark ix. 12) by any process in heaven or earth. The fury of God's wrath unnumbered (Rev. xv. 10)—that is, at its fullest conceivable—cannot be less than eternal, or it is a dilution. Hell is mercy to the universe; for it is eternal which keeps in perpetual internment all incurable criminals and moral maniacs.

good; there is no evil."¹ To eradicate from the human heart, itself a smothered volcano of evil (Mark vii. 21-23, Rom. iii. 13, 14), the very conviction and consciousness of sin, is to open an appalling fountain of iniquity. Closely akin was the Gnostic doctrine that lust to the Illuminate was not lust: that matter being unreal, sin in action is equally illusory: that men best mortify sense by indulging in every carnality.² Such receive the awful condemnation of the Holy Ghost. "Uttering great swelling words of vanity, they entice in the lusts of the flesh, by lasciviousness, those who are just escaping from them that live in error; promising them liberty, while they themselves are bondservants of corruption" (2 Peter ii. 18). "The whole truth [about Christian Science]," says Mr. Peabody, "cannot be publicly told. It is not suitable for public discussion. It cannot be repeated in polite society."³ Sin will always be committed with impunity where its very existence, and much more its guilt, are denied, until, as among the Ophite Gnostics, evil becomes deified and worshipped under the form of the Serpent;—"having eyes full of adultery, and that cannot cease

¹ *Ibid.*, p. 147.

² Dean Mansel's *Gnostic Heresies*, p. 135

³ *Exposure of Eddyism*, p. 3. As Dr. A. J. Gordon says:—"If the body is only a phantom and the flesh only a shadow, it is logically certain that by and by some very practical sinners will take refuge under the system, and insist that the sins of the body and the transgressions of the flesh are harmless, since they are now only the phantom of a phantom, and the shadow of a shadow."

from sin; for whom the blackness of darkness hath been reserved" (2 Peter ii. 14). Sin being unreal, its consequences—disease and death—are unreal too, in this philosophy of illusion. So its healings are deeply antagonistic to God's truth. For the truth lies far deeper. "Sin entered into the world, and death through sin" (Rom. v. 12); and so death can be cured only by the cure of sin. A corpse is not an hallucination, but a sinner executed: and the reality of the execution is a supreme proof of the deadliness of the sin. (Gen. ii. 17; Jas. i. 15.) Therefore Christ reaches down past the disease of the body to the disease of the soul, and ultimately heals the casket by first purifying the jewel. "The sting of death is sin; and the power of sin is the law: but thanks be to God, which giveth us the victory through our Lord Jesus Christ" (1 Cor. xv. 56).

3. Christian Science also denies the reality of our Lord's person. For it separates sharply between Jesus and the Christ. "Jesus was born of Mary, Christ was born of God . . . This dual personality continued until the Master's ascension; when the human, the corporeal concept, or Jesus, disappeared; while His invisible Self, or Christ, continued to exist."¹ This is

¹ *Science and Health*, p. 229. So of Christ it is said: "Wearing in part a human form (that is, as it seemed to mortal view)." *Science and Health*, p. 211. "Neither spear nor cross," says the Christian Scientist, echoing the Docetic Gnostic, "could harm Him; let them think to kill the body, and after this He was not dead." But see 1 John i. 1-3. Cp. Mansel's *Gnostic Heresies*, pp. 74-77.

1 There is an enormous historical obstacle to his theory of which the Universalist rarely seems to feel the overpowering force. All generations of all sections of the Church—the holiest and the worldliest, the giant intellect and the illiterate believer, the closest to God and the furthest from God—have believed unwaveringly (with trilling exceptions) that the Bible states an eternal hell. Now this does not prove that the doctrine is true, but it establishes an enormous presumption that it is in the Bible; for it is conceivable that, on a doctrine so repellent to the natural mind that it could never have been received except on overwhelming authority, the whole Church has made a blunder so colossal as to mistake the Bible's teaching of universal salvation for eternal damnation? No truth we hold with the Church of all ages could in that case be safe. Nor can we appeal to the general decay of belief in eternal punishment during the last fifty years; for that decay has advanced *pari passu* with unbelief in every direction; and that logic can only land us in the total abandonment of the Christian Faith.

nouncing sentence. He conceals it with extraordinary care; the demons know of no cessation (Matt. viii. 29); the Church for nineteen centuries has discovered none; and no fresh revelation from heaven has brought news of an amnesty in hell.¹ And the extremity of the scene is heightened by the extreme reluctance of God to begin it at all. He postpones this fearful decision to the last possible moment: we ourselves are in the "last days"; the millennial age is the "last day"; and this judgment takes

undiluted Gnosticism; and is that against which the Holy Spirit levelled the profound words, "This is He that came by water and blood, even Jesus Christ; not with the water only, but with the water and with the blood" (1 John v. 6). Before His baptism, during crucifixion, and after His ascension, JESUS was THE CHRIST. Cerinthus, the Gnostic, said: "After His baptism the Christ descended into Jesus: at the end of His suffering, the Christ flew up from Him;" and against Cerinthus John probably wrote. But the Holy Person was, from first to last, one and indivisible: Stephen "saw the glory of God, AND JESUS standing on the right hand of God" (Acts vii. 55). An atonement—it has been said—which is not an atonement, based on sufferings which were not sufferings, wrought in a Body which was not a body, as an expiation for sin which was not sin,—this is a Christian Science which is neither Christianity nor Science.

Thus in root principles Christian Science is Gnosticism.¹ It also bears further curious and remarkable features

1 Gnosticism is also re-erecting its head *within* the Church of God. Denial of the Virgin Birth of our Lord—a spreading denial—by Christians professing belief in the Incarnation must ultimately, for the discovery of an alternate mode of incarnation, shut them up to Gnosticism. *Cerinthus was the first Christian teacher to deny the Virgin Birth*: if the Incarnation did not enter through miraculous conception, it must have descended by an Aeon. Gnosticism is yet to be the foundation of the Apostasy. 1 Tim. iv. 1-4.

dispensations, whatever judgments mingled in them, always sought to deliver men from their works, not to judge them by their works; to free the guilty, to wash the foul; so that immediately before the judgment epoch, the word was,—"Now is the day of salvation"; but that "now" has vanished, the mercy-limit is passed, all probation is over; that is, the law now takes its course. All who refused mercy now are confronted then, not with vindictiveness or harshness, but with strict equity; everything done will commend itself to the criminal's conscience as the perfection of justice; but that involves the complete disappearance of mercy (Deut. xiii. 8). It is also exceedingly striking that whereas the degree of guilt, and therefore of punishment, is decided by the biographies, the Books of Works, the sentence to hell is adjudged solely on the catalogue, the Book of Names: what then can ever save such afterwards? However shall they become the subjects of pardon whose names are not, and never have been, in the book of pardon? "If any was not found written in the book of life, he was cast into the lake of fire." Nor does the sentence carry with it the least hint of cessation. No terminable sentence is ever passed in a law court, and its duration not stated: if there is an end to hell, God does not seem to know it, or else, in the very act of pro-

identical with Satan's ancient and deadly deceit. For (1) tentative approaches are made to the prohibition of marriage. "Until it is learned that generation rests on no sexual basis, let marriage continue. . . . The time cometh when man . . . shall be as the angels;" not, however, in resurrection; for all resurrection, even our Lord's, is totally denied. "His disciples believed Jesus dead while He was hidden in the sepulchre; whereas He was alive."² It is a first feeler towards that bold prohibition of marriage in latter-day Gnosticism, which is to be one of the basic principles (1 Tim. iv. 1-3) of the great Apostasy. "Marriage is spiritual unity. Proportionately as human generation ceases, harmonious being will be spiritually discerned." It is deeply instructive to observe that these utterances have been expunged from later additions of "Science and Health," as the time has not been felt to be fully ripe. (2) An antagonistic cleavage is made between Elohim and Jehovah. "Idolatry is found among the Israelites also. They called the Supreme Being by the name of Jehovah. In that name of Jehovah the true idea of God seems almost lost. He becomes 'a man of war,' a tribal God."³ Jehovah thus becomes closely akin to the Demiurge of the Gnostics; a blind creator of the world, whom to worship is idolatry. (3) Christian Science is allied, as was

1 *Science and Health*, p. 274.
2 *Ibid.*, p. 349.
3 *Ibid.*, pp. 517, 34.

1 The world, which feels no terror but that of agony, itself says:—"The fires of a material hell are replaced by the steam-heat of moral fortune. This even the most sensitive of sinners faces with equanimity. In place of the Devil of earlier ages is a poor, make-believe thing, labelled—'Demon of Moral Repentance, guaranteed worse than actual fire.' The poor thing grins in its very harmlessness." (S. Lee-cock's *Essays and Literary Studies*.)

more alive or more agile or more malignant (Rev. xx. fires of Dives for a thousand years, emerges never servative, Satan himself, after incarceration in the or purgatorial, or anything but punitive and pre- rendered will. So far from the fire being remedial the entrance of God's Spirit acting upon a sur- it is not the punishment that changes the man, but His Gospel, constantly leads men to salvation; but earth, baked by God's grace, and supplemented by powerless to produce goodness. Punishment on receive God's offers of mercy, by itself is utterly the proud will of man as to make him ready to vine of the folly of sin, and while it can con- never saves or sanctifies. Pain, while it can con- salist is bound to answer. For (1) pain, by itself, escape out of it? It is a question which the Univer- judgment [which consists] of Gehenna?"; that is, it still sinning, how avoid hell, and, once in it, how which our LORD launches like a thunderbolt at the breast of the Pharisees: "How shall ye escape the an earlier judgment throne (Rev. iv. 2), when terror was seeking to save where mercy had failed, there were trumpets and hosannas and chorusing angels, as out of the very vials of wrath bands of delivered martyrs rose into heaven. Before this throne there is absolute stillness; even the angels are hushed in silence; for it is the crisis of godless destiny, with- out a single note of gladness or a ray of hope. The mercy-rainbow (Rev. iv. 3) is gone from a throne now naked and lonely in its awful whiteness; no seven torches—the Holy Spirit of God—now stand between the sinner and the throne: no Mediator, no Saviour appears, only a Judge. It is said that a great composer wrote, for a musical festival, an anthem on the final judgment. At one point he introduced the cries of the lost; but no singer could be found to take the part: so, when that point in the score was reached, the leader of the orchestra simply beat time while all stood in dead silence; until, when the awful chiasm was passed, the entire chorus broke into "the shout of them that triumph, the song of them that feast." The whole universe holds its breath to watch the begin- nings of hell.

For "how can ye escape the damnation of hell?" (Matt. xxiii. 33). This is the terrible question

place in the last moments of the last day. Before an earlier judgment throne (Rev. iv. 2), when terror was seeking to save where mercy had failed, there were trumpets and hosannas and chorusing angels, as out of the very vials of wrath bands of delivered martyrs rose into heaven. Before this throne there is absolute stillness; even the angels are hushed in silence; for it is the crisis of godless destiny, with- out a single note of gladness or a ray of hope. The mercy-rainbow (Rev. iv. 3) is gone from a throne now naked and lonely in its awful whiteness; no seven torches—the Holy Spirit of God—now stand between the sinner and the throne: no Mediator, no Saviour appears, only a Judge. It is said that a great composer wrote, for a musical festival, an anthem on the final judgment. At one point he introduced the cries of the lost; but no singer could be found to take the part: so, when that point in the score was reached, the leader of the orchestra simply beat time while all stood in dead silence; until, when the awful chiasm was passed, the entire chorus broke into "the shout of them that triumph, the song of them that feast." The whole universe holds its breath to watch the begin- nings of hell.

Gnosticism, to various forms of magic and occult art. The fascination is obviously due to a powerful inspiration behind it, an inspiration which Mrs. Eddy claims to be Divine. "I should blush," she said, "to write of *Science and Health* as I have, were it of human origin, and I, apart from God, its author:" the bylaws in her *Church Manual*, she says, "were impelled by a power not one's own." But Mrs. Eddy was once a Spiritualistic Medium, gaining a precarious living by public seances in Boston until she abandoned—in 1907 she possessed a million dollars worth of taxable property—Spiritualism for Christian Science. Mr. Quimby also, from whom Mrs. Eddy drew her first inspirations, was a travelling Mesmerist who distinguished, in his teaching, between Jesus and the Christ. Mrs. Eddy, like Madame Blavatsky and Mrs. Besant, is one of the mighty Sorceresses of the modern world. "At times her attacks resembled convulsions. She fell headlong to the floor, writhing and screaming in apparent agony. Again she dropped as if lifeless, and lay limp and motionless, until restored. At other times she became rigid like a cataleptic." For with Simon the Magician, the reputed founder of Gnosticism—"thou wilt become," says the apostle, "a root of bitterness"—Mrs. Eddy affords a curious parallel. Both once members in the Church of God, both apostatized: so long as there is faith in a personal God, in the

creeds, and in prayer, said Mrs. Eddy, no progress can be made.¹ Simon presented himself, and was accepted, as "that power of God which is called Great" (Acts viii. 10): "I am Wisdom," said Mrs. Eddy, "and this revelation is mine": "unless we hear Her voice," said the Christian Science Association in 1882, "we do not hear His voice."² Simon "amazed [or bewitched] them with his sorceries" (Acts viii. 11): so Mrs. Eddy, a clairvoyant and trance medium, was able, in the class-room or on the platform, to create in others an emotional exaltation so powerful—according to those under its spell—as to resemble a new birth.³ For Mrs. Eddy's 'malicious animal magnetism,' like Simon's, was pure Sorcery. Threats of death, the efficacy of which was not doubted, and which have abounded in Christian Science, drove Mrs. Eddy nearly mad with fear, and produced law-suits founded on charges of murder by witchcraft. "In coming years," she says, "the person or mind that hates his neighbour will have no need to traverse his fields to destroy his flocks and herds"; "in warfare with error we attack with intent to kill, as the wounded or cornered beast turns on its assailant"; "they should have fear for their own lives in their attempts to kill us."⁴ Mr. G. W. Louttit, a former First

1 Miss Milmine's *Life of Mary Baker G. Eddy*, p. 21: London, 1909.

1 *Ibid*, p. 145.
2 *Ibid*, pp. 332, 278.
3 *Life*, pp. 156, 263.
4 *Ibid*, pp. 224, 354.

impairing the judgment and blinding the vision, not clearing them: every hour in hell makes heaven more infinitely remote. "THEY SHALL NOT DRIVERS THEMSELVES FROM THE POWER OF THE FLAME" (Isa. lxvii. 14).

(3) Again it is morally impossible for God to compel salvation. It is constantly forgotten that God imposed a self-limitation upon Himself, consciously and deliberately, the moment He created man or angel with free will—that awful power which can defy God Himself. God has not made men automata; therefore He will not. Intellectually, we can conceive God restoring all souls by sheer compulsion and power; but what would this mean? For God to make sin to be followed by eternal joy would, morally, be the same as making, by sheer force of omnipotence, goodness to be followed by eternal misery. How can God do either? To do it, God would have to destroy the foundations of His own being, outrage His own law, and overturn the bases of all righteousness. To empty the Bottomless Pit solely by Divine fiat would be as immoral as putting holy angels to unmerited pain; and since God acts with unswerving justice, He can do neither. This is the answer to the contention that an eternal hell defeats the purpose of God. It does not; because God never purposed to save any

soul was struggling Christ-wards, Spurgeon says: "In the blackest darkness I resolved that, if I never had another ray of comfort, and even if I was everlastingly lost, yet I would love Jesus, and endeavour to run in the way of His commandments: from the time I was enabled thus to resolve, all the clouds fled." What was the secret? "We love Him because He first loved us" (1 John iv. 19). Where has God ever said that He will begin to love any soul in hell? and if He does not begin to love, how is it to begin in hell? The tender heart which dreams of reform in hell can never have realized the malignancy of evil, the obduracy of the will, or the eternity of sin. And, even if reform were possible, we should be met with the astounding and impossible conclusion that hell is the great centre of salvation, the true home of grace, the focus of supreme hope, and God's greatest harvest field where the vast mass of the human race will be reaped for heaven. Could any possible conclusion be more remote from the Christian Faith? Alas, we know from bitter experience that the truth is far different. So far from tending to recover, sin always deepens and accelerates; exactly as a falling body falls more swiftly the farther it falls, so sin increases—deadening the conscience, not making it more acute; drugging the soul, not waking it;

second chapter, who is not the creation of God, but is that which error says God has made. Adam or mortal man never had a perfect state; he is of 'the earth earthy,' and must be born again. When the new birth takes place, the unfallen man begins to appear in consciousness and is 'the Lord from heaven,' as St. Paul tells us in 1 Corinthians, 15: 47.

3.—Author's rejoinder:—"Man is unfallen and eternal. Jesus beheld the perfect man, who appeared to Him, where sinning mortal man appears to us. . . . Thus Jesus taught that the Kingdom of God is universal, and man unfallen, pure and holy" (*Science and Health*, p. 472). "Man is incapable of sin" (*Ib.*, p. 471). "The great truth that man was, is, and ever shall be perfect is incontrovertible" (*Ib.*, p. 96).

II. 1.—Statement:—"It denies that any judgment awaits mankind."

2.—Reply:—"This is untrue. Christian Science teaches that judgment is going on perpetually, and the final judgment day will be when the last mortal fault is destroyed."

3.—Rejoinder:—"I said *awaits* mankind. "No final judgment awaits mortals; for the judgment day of Wisdom comes hourly and continually" (*Science and Health*, p. 187).

III. 1.—Statement:—"It denies any power or advantage in prayer."

2.—"This again is not true. Prayer is the practice of Christian Science, and Christian Scientists are

learning to obey St. Paul's admonition to 'pray without ceasing' Every case of healing, moral, physical, and mental, which takes place in Christian Science is the result of prayer to God."

3.—Rejoinder:—"Prayer to a corporeal [*sic*] God affects the sick like a drug, having no efficacy of its own, borrowing its power from human faith and belief. This common custom, of praying for the recovery of the sick, finds help in blind belief; whereas help should come from enlightened understanding." (*Science and Health*, p. 317).¹

IV. 1.—Statement:—"It denies the existence of the Holy Spirit."

2.—Reply:—"It is strange you should make such a statement, for in the Christian Science text-book, *Science and Health* (page 359), Mrs. Eddy says, 'I have healed infidels whose only objection to this method was, that I as a Christian Scientist believed in the Holy Spirit, while they, the patients, did not.'"

1 It is the Gnostic habit of Christian Science, and the most hellish of all spiritual perils, to extract the gold from sacred words, and then to re-issue the debased coinage for circulation. *Prayer, to a Christian Scientist, never means prayer to a personal God; prayer to a personal God is a hindrance* (*Science and Health*, p. 7); as there is no personal God, whatever the Christian Scientist means by "prayer" is not *prayer*. Apart from a travesty of the Lord's Prayer, in which every petition is caricatured and turned into a statement, so as to cancel it as prayer, NO PRAYER IS EVER OFFERED IN CHRISTIAN SCIENCE WORSHIP.

1 Of lost spirits it is revealed that they are "branded in their own conscience as with a hot iron" (1 Tim. iv. 2):

The system which saves wicked spirits
ated or reformed throughout all the centuries of
delivered for whom Christ never died, whose sin has
created beings whatsoever are saved, angels are
ated in one race, and not in another; while if all
sin becomes (if all men are saved) unjustly obliter-
ated if hell remains unemptied all collapse, and
ments that rest on the alleged "defeated purposes"
list. For if devils are unsaved, all or any, the argu-
remain a hopeless stumbling-block to the Universa-
Finally, the destiny of the evil angels must ever
disappears with the eternity of hell.

The eternity of God and the holy and heaven equally
used in relation to the life and happiness of the righteous.
world-time. Of the sixty-six undisputed passages in which
ing passages it is used in the sense of age or world—properly
and in five to the punishment of the wicked. In the remain-
in nine it is applied to the future happiness of the righteous;
does; in seven it expresses an indefinite period in ages past;
these cases it is applied to something which Christ is or
of ever, with a negative never, and in a great majority of
one of the Word of God; in eighteen it is used in the sense
it is predicated of the kingdom or dominion of Christ; in four
Christ; in five it is applied to the existence of God; in four

(4) Again the terms in which the sentence to the
Take as couched shut off all possibility of outlet.
That sentence is sevenfold: eternal judgment (Hab.
vi. 2); eternal condemnation (Mark iii. 29); eternal
punishment (Matt. xxv. 46); eternal destruction (2
Thess. i. 9); eternal vengeance (Jude 7); eternal
torment (Rev. xiv. 10, 11); and eternal fire (Matt.
xxv. 41); that is, the process, the instruments, and
the criminals are all eternal. To empty hell is
equally to empty heaven. For the word 'eternal'
occurs in contexts so placed as to destroy equally
the eternity of good and evil, if either be non-
eternal: e.g., "These shall go away into eternal
punishment, but the righteous into eternal life"
(Matt. xxv. 46). In the summary of Dr. Tyler:

man against his will: His purpose was (and it has
been perfectly accomplished) to effect salvation for
all, and to confer it on "whosoever will." No way
of overthrowing the moral foundations of the
universe more effectual could be conceived than for
God to issue a decree saving all men regardless of
their moral character. The "restitution of all
things" is only "the restitution of all things
whereof God spake by the mouth of His holy pro-
phets" (Acts iii. 21).

3.—Rejoinder:—But what does Mrs. Eddy herself
say that she means by 'the Holy Spirit'? Her
Glossary says: "'Holy Ghost'; Divine Science,
understood and acknowledged" (*Science and Health*,
p. 579). "The Holy Ghost, or Spirit, is expressed in
Divine Science, or the Holy Comforter."

V. 1.—Statement:—"It denies any efficacy in the
Atonement of Christ."

2.—Reply:—"This also is not true. In the
Christian Science text-book there is a chapter on the
atonement, which is the clearest exposition of the
subject that has ever been given to the world. In that
Mrs. Eddy says, 'The atonement of Christ reconciles
man to God' (page 18)."

3.—Rejoinder:—"The material blood of Jesus was
no more efficacious to cleanse from sin, when it was
shed upon the 'accursed tree,' than when it was
flowing in His veins" (*Science and Health*, p. 330).
"Does erudite theology regard the crucifixion of Jesus
as chiefly providing a ready pardon for all sinners who
ask for it, and are willing to be forgiven? Then we
must differ. The efficacy of the crucifixion lies in the
practical affection and goodness it demonstrates for
mankind" (*Ib.*, p. 329). "One sacrifice, however
great, is insufficient to pay the debt of sin" (*Ib.*, p. 328).

VI. 1.—Statement:—"It denies that Jesus was the
Christ."

2.—Reply:—"Christian Science teaches that
Christ is the spiritual selfhood of Jesus. When Jesus

declared 'Before Abraham was, I am,' he was referring
to the spiritual selfhood, or Christ, which existed before
the world was, as he himself declared (John, 17 : 5).

3.—Rejoinder:—"The invisible Christ was in-
corporeal, whereas Jesus was a corporeal or bodily
existence. This dual personality, the Christ and Jesus,
continued until the Master's ascension; when the
human, the corporeal concept, or Jesus, disappeared;
while his invisible self, or Christ, continued to exist in
the eternal order of Divine Science" (*Science and
Health*, p. 229). That is, Jesus never was the Christ;
but the two, temporarily linked, have now been
permanently disjoined. This is Gnosticism.

VII. 1.—Statement:—"It denies that our Lord was in
any sense the Son of God in which another man is not."

2.—Reply:—"Christian Science teaches, as the
Bible teaches, that the spiritual selfhood of each of us
is the son of God. Our Master brought this out very
clearly when he said, 'I in them, and thou in me, that
they may be made perfect in one' (John 17, 23)."

3.—Rejoinder:—"So my statement is admitted.
"Jesus was not God's Son in any other sense than
every man is God's son" (*Science and Health*, p. 229).*

VIII. 1.—Statement:—"It denies that our Lord either
died or rose again."

* A sentence apparently omitted in my edition, but present in
the 138th. A subtle and studied system is elaborated, making
Incarnation inconceivable. "God cannot become finite and so
be limited within material bounds" (*Ibid.*, p. 542). "If God is

ultimate restoration and salvation of all men, or any doctrine of annihilation, or cessation of conscious suffering, lose their power for God." And could anything be more awful than to tell men in the name of Christ that they will all be saved, and to find it is not true when it is too late to warn them? The life of Jehovah is for ever and ever (Rev. x. 6); the glory of God is for ever and ever (Gal. i. 5); the throne of God's Son is for ever and ever (Hab. i. 8); the reign of the righteous is for ever and ever (Rev. xxii. 5); "AND THE SMOKE OF THEIR TORMENT ASCENDETH UP FOR EVER AND EVER" (Rev. xiv. 11).

2.—Reply:—"It certainly denies that Jesus ever died in reality: he seemed to die to those around him, but in those three days in the tomb he was working out the problem of healing, and his own resurrection. Through his resurrection he destroyed the belief in death for himself, and for the salvation of mankind."

3.—Rejoinder:—So my statement is admitted. "His disciples believed Jesus was dead while he was hidden in the sepulchre; whereas he was alive" (*Science and Health*, p. 349). Since He never died, He, of course, never rose. "Miracles are impossible in [Christian] Science, and here it takes issue with popular religions" (*Ib.*, p. 249).

IX. 1:—Statement:—"It denies that God is a Personal Being at all."

2.—Reply:—"It certainly denies that God is a corporeal, anthropomorphic being, but it teaches that God is personal in an infinite sense. A corporeal God cannot be infinite, ever-present and incorporeal."

3.—Rejoinder:—That God is corporeal is Mormonism, not Christianity. What I said was that Christian Science denies that God is personal. "God is mind. He is Principle, not person" (*Science and Health*, p. 317). † "God is divine principle" (*Ib.*, p. 198). So the Scrip-

limited to man or matter, or if the Infinite could be circumscribed within the finite, God would then be corporeal, and unlimited Mind would seem to spring from a limited body; but this is an impossibility" (*Ib.*, p. 180).

† In 110th edition.

their conscience, through sin, is cauterized, burnt out, dead: therefore the undying worm and the unquenched fire (into which the Devil and his angels are cast after their consciences have been thus destroyed) are not conscience. Even on earth there are men "past feeling" (Eph. iv. 19)—that is, past moral feeling; so that if conscience is the undying worm, the most hardened in hell would be the least sufferers.

2 Extraordinarily clear is the type. Sodom and Gomorrah, "suffering the punishment of eternal fire" (Jude 7) are "an EXAMPLE" (2 Pet. ii. 6), a lake of fire, then a lake of salt—for our Saviour says, "They shall be called with fire" (Mark ix. 49); the fire of Gehenna being preservative, not annihilative; the most depressed plateau on the surface of the earth, as Gehenna will be on the new earth, the Jordan flows into it, but never emerges, FOR THERE IS NO OUTFLET; and for all ages since it has been the Dead Sea. We can never reach heaven by wading through hell.

without the Gospel can hardly expect to be believed when it saves the finally impenitent of mankind against their will? There is something far from beautiful in the moral disposition which can use the Christian Faith to cloak principles deeply antagonistic to it, so as to gain the prestige of Christ without charging oneself with His solemn renunciations. "A long and watchful experience," says Dr. R. A. Torrey, "studying the men who hold the non-eternity of punishment, has convinced me that as a matter of fact the men who hold any form of the

ture is changed. Christ is "the brightness of His [God's] glory and the express [expressed] image of His personality [infinite Mind]" (*Ib.*, p. 209). Thus "the theory of three persons in one God (that is, a personal Trinity or Triunity) suggests heathen gods" (*Ib.*, p. 152).

Thus it is certain that Christian Science means to say these things, and has said them very effectually: only limits of space prevent proof a hundredfold ampler. That Mrs. Eddy, largely an illiterate woman, should unconsciously reproduce the subtlest ancient attack on the Faith is a remarkable proof that her system is a "plant" from the unseen. "Christian Scientists," says Dr. David Smith, "have borrowed many of their ideas, whether consciously or not, from the ancient Gnostic schools of Valentinus. The God of both Christian Gnostic and Scientist is impersonal, being Universal Mind in one and Bythus in the other. The dual personality of Jesus is also asserted in both systems. The distinction which the Christian Scientists make between Christ and Jesus is based upon the Gnostic division of the aeon Jesus and the 'nether' Christ. The process of redemption is also similar in both systems." "This craze," says Dr. Frank Ballard, "is neither more nor less than a recrudescence of Gnosticism.**

** No Christian Science figures (it is officially stated) are published: but its enormous growth can be judged by an increase, as far back as 1915, of three "churches" per week; *Science and Health*, many years ago, in its 440th edition; and its possession of one of the greatest daily newspapers in the world, *The Christian Science Monitor*.